July 14, 2005

The Honorable Arlen Specter
Chairman
United States Senate Judiciary Committee
711 Hart Senate Office Building
Washington, D.C. 20510

The Honorable Patrick Leahy
Ranking Member
United States Senate Judiciary Committee
433 Russell Senate Office Building
Washington, D.C. 20510

Dear Senators Specter and Leahy,

As interpreters of the Constitution, the federal courts play a central role in safeguarding our liberties, upholding the rule of law against governmental intrusions and excesses, and ensuring that every person is accorded due process and the equal protection of the law. The judiciary is able to play this vital role precisely because it is not a political branch of government. Under Article III of the Constitution, federal judges are given life tenure so as to be free of political influences that would interfere with their ability to exercise their duties fairly and impartially.

Because federal judges do not serve fixed terms of office, we believe it is critical that the Senate, in giving its Advice and Consent, undertake a searching inquiry to assure itself that judicial nominees meet the highest standards of character and integrity; that they will consider each case with an open mind; and that their views are within the constitutional mainstream.

We believe that the Senate's explicit authority to give its Advice and Consent to judicial nominations includes the power to consider nominees' beliefs about the Constitution and the role of the courts in interpreting it. We further believe that, in evaluating nominees, the Senate should be especially skeptical of nominees who approach questions of constitutional meaning from extreme, rigid, and divisive perspectives.

We respectfully urge that the following questions be asked of each nominee who comes before the Judiciary Committee so that the Senate can determine whether the nominee would uphold these principles.
In order to approach constitutional questions as consistently as possible, jurists often adopt a particular "canon of construction," i.e., a method of interpreting the Constitution. Some are "textualists" or "strict constructionists" who limit themselves to applying the black and white text of the Constitution. Some are "originalists" who rely on the writings of the Framers and the laws in place at the time the Constitution was written to inform the meaning of the text when it is unclear. Still others employ "structural reasoning," which requires an analysis of how different parts of the Constitution and the governmental branches relate to one another.

1. Do you believe in employing a canon of construction? If so, is there a particular canon to which you subscribe?

Many constitutional principles that Americans now take for granted—such as freedom of association and one person, one vote—are not expressly written in the Constitution and were never considered by the Framers but were articulated by the Supreme Court in landmark decisions.

2. Do you believe it is appropriate for the Supreme Court to recognize constitutional principles that were not expressly written in the Constitution or explicitly recognized by the Framers?

The Constitution provides that the government may not deprive a person of life, liberty, or property without due process of law. The Due Process Clause has been interpreted to include "procedural" elements, such as the right to be given notice and a hearing before the government may take certain actions, and "substantive" elements that provide constitutional protection for fundamental rights, such as the right to marry and the right to contract.

3. What rights, if any, do you believe are protected by substantive due process?

The Supreme Court has declared that the Constitution contains a right to privacy.

4. Do you believe there is a constitutionally protected right to privacy, and, if so, under what circumstances does it apply?

The Supreme Court has established a framework for determining when certain classes of people are protected by the Equal Protection Clause. For instance, when the government makes classifications based upon characteristics such as race and sex, those classifications are subject to heightened scrutiny and more likely to be found unconstitutional. Classifications based on economic distinctions, on the other hand, have been subjected to only limited judicial scrutiny.

5. Do you agree with the tiers of review currently employed under Equal Protection jurisprudence and the way they have been applied? Explain.

The Constitution provides that Congress has power to pass laws only for certain purposes. Over the last 50 years, Congress has routinely invoked its power under two constitutional provisions—the Commerce Clause and section 5 of the 14th Amendment—to ensure that employers, schools,
and neighborhoods would not discriminate against people because of their race, sex, age, religion, or disability. Recent decisions of the Court, however, have limited the breadth of these powers.

6. What in your view are the limits on the scope of Congress' power under the Commerce Clause and section 5 of the Fourteenth Amendment?

The text of the Eleventh Amendment provides only that a state may not be sued in federal court by individuals who do not reside in that state. The Supreme Court has broadened this to say that a state cannot be sued by its own citizens under federal law in federal court, state court, or before a federal agency without the state's consent.

7. What do you believe is the appropriate scope of state sovereign immunity and the Eleventh Amendment?

The phrase "judicial activism" has often been used to critique the approach of judges on both ends of the ideological spectrum.

8. Define "judicial activism" and describe your views on it.

The attacks of September 11 have prompted a constitutional debate over the limits of government power and the scope of presidential authority in a time of national crisis.

9. Do you believe there are judicially enforceable limits to the President's power as Commander-in-Chief in times of national crisis? If so, what are those limits?

10. In Korematsu v. United States, the Supreme Court upheld the constitutionality of evacuating Japanese-American citizens on the West Coast from their homes during World War II. What lessons do you believe the Court should draw from Korematsu and the World War II experience?
Michelle Adams  
Professor of Law  
Seton Hall University School of Law

Jane H. Aiken  
William M. Van Cleve  
Professor of Law  
Washington University School of Law

Barbara Bader Aldave  
Stewart Professor of Law  
University of Oregon

William D. Araiza  
Professor of Law  
Loyola Law School, Los Angeles

Barbara Allen Babcock  
Judge John Crown Professor of Law, Emerita  
Stanford Law School

James Francis Bailey, III  
Professor of Law Emeritus and  
Director Emeritus of the Ruth Lilly Law Library  
Indiana University School of Law

Margaret Martin Barry  
Associate Professor  
Columbus School of Law  
The Catholic University of America

Gary Blasi  
Professor of Law  
University of California, Los Angeles School of Law

Professor Karen M. Blum  
Suffolk University Law School

Rebecca Bratspies  
Associate Professor  
City University of New York School of Law

Professor John C. Brittain  
Thurgood Marshall School of Law  
Texas Southern University

Mark R. Brown  
Newton D. Baker/Baker & Hostetler Professor of Law  
Capital University

Rebecca L. Brown  
Allen Professor of Law  
Vanderbilt Law School

Professor Susan Bryant  
Professor of Law  
City University of New York School of Law

Barbara Bucholtz  
Professor of Law  
University of Tulsa, College of Law

Sande L. Buhai  
Clinical Professor  
Loyola Law School

Richard M. Buxbaum  
Professor of Law  
School of Law (Boalt Hall)  
University of California at Berkeley

Elaine Cassel  
Professor of Law  
Concord University School of Law

Diana Clark  
University of Tulsa College of Law

Richard Pierre Claude  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Maryland

Marjorie Cohn  
Executive Vice President  
National Lawyers Guild  
Professor of Law  
Thomas Jefferson School of Law

Luke Cole  
Director, Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment  
Visiting Professor, University of California at Hastings

Jeffrey O. Cooper  
Associate Professor  
Indiana University School of Law-Indianapolis

Frank Deale  
Assoc Prof. of Law  
City University of New York School of Law

John M. A. DiPippa  
Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and  
Distinguished Professor of Law and Public Policy  
University of Arkansas at Little Rock  
William H. Bowen School of Law

Jane Dolkart  
Visiting Professor of Law  
Washington College of Law  
American University

Jennifer A. Drobac, J.S.D.  
Associate Professor  
Indiana University School of Law-Indianapolis
Chai Feldblum
Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center

Linda E. Fisher
Associate Prof. of Law
Seton Hall Law School

Catherine Fisk
Professor of Law
Duke University

Martin S. Flaherty
Professor of Law
Co-Director, Joseph R. Crowley Program in International Human Rights

David Franklin
Assistant Professor
DePaul College of Law

Frederick Mark Gedicks
Professor of Law
Brigham Young University

Steven G. Gey
Fonvielle & Hinkle Professor of Law
Florida State University College of Law

Theresa Glennon
Professor of Law
James E. Beasley School of Law at Temple University

Howard A Glickstein
Professor and Dean Emeritus
Touro Law Center

Kent Greenfield
Professor of Law and Thomas Carney Scholar
Boston College Law School

Sidney L. Harring
Professor of Law
City University of New York School of Law

Lynne Henderson
Boyd School of Law—UNLV

Prof. Stanley D. Henderson
University of Virginia Law School

Susan N. Herman
Centennial Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Professor Joyce A. Hughes
Northwestern University School of Law

Marsha Huie
Professor of Law
The University of Tulsa College of Law

Kent Hull
Adjunct Associate Professor
Notre Dame Law School

Lisa C. Ikemoto
Professor
Loyola Law School

Eric S. Janus
Professor of Law
William Mitchell College of Law

Steven Jonas, MD, MPH, MS, FNYAS
Adjunct Professor of Legal Education at the Touro Law School
Professor of Preventive Medicine
School of Medicine
Stony Brook University

José Roberto Juárez, Jr.
Professor of Law
St. Mary’s University School of Law

David Kairys
James E. Beasley Professor of Law
Beasley School of Law

Helen H. Kang
Associate Professor
Environmental Law & Justice Clinic
Golden Gate University School of Law

Prof. Leonard V. Kaplan
Mortimer Jackson Chair of Law
University of Wisconsin Law School

Eileen Kaufman
Professor of Law
Touro Law School

Walter J. Kendall III (Jerry)
The John Marshall Law School

Ken Kimerling
Adjunct Professor
Fordham Law School Legal Director
Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund

Eleanor D. Kinney, JD, MPH
Hall Render Professor of Law Co-Director, The Center for Law and Health
Indiana University School of Law-Indianapolis

Professor Richard Klein
Touro Law School
Philip A. Klinkner
James S. Sherman Associate Professor of Government
Hamilton College

Lydia Lazar
Assistant Dean, International Law and Policy Development
Chicago-Kent College of Law

Donna H. Lee
Associate Professor of Law
City University of New York School of Law

Jeff L. Lewin
Adjunct Professor
Widener University School of Law

Peter Linzer
Professor of Law
University of Houston Law Center

Stephen Loffredo
Professor of Law
City University of New York School of Law

Professor Ian Haney Lopez
Boalt Hall School of Law
UC Berkeley

Professor Andrea D. Lyon
Director, The Center for Justice in Capital Cases
DePaul College of Law

H.C. Macgill
Professor of Law
Director, Int'l Graduate Studies
University of Connecticut School of Law

Tayyab Mahmud, Ph.D.; J.D.
Professor of Law
Chair, Global Perspectives Group
John Marshall Law School

Marcia L. McCormick
Visiting Assistant Professor
Chicago-Kent College of Law

Patrick C. McGinley
Professor of Law
College of Law
West Virginia University

Muriel Morisey
Associate Professor of Law
Temple University

Sheldon Nahmod
Distinguished Professor of Law
Chicago-Kent College of Law

Molly O’Brien
Associate Professor of Law
University of Akron School of Law

Marc R. Poirier
Professor of Law
Seton Hall University School of Law

Edward A. Purcell, Jr.
Joseph Solomon
Distinguished Professor
New York Law School

William P. Quigley
Professor
Loyola University New Orleans School of Law

Lynne H. Rambo
Professor of Law
(Constitutional Law)
Texas Wesleyan University
School of Law

Florence Wagman Roisman
Michael D. McCormick
Professor of Law
Indiana University School of Law-Indianapolis

Professor Margaret M. Russell
Santa Clara University
School of Law

David Schultz, Professor
Hamline University
Graduate School of Public Administration and Management

Marci Seville
Professor of Law
Golden Gate University
School of Law

Peter M. Shane
Joseph S. Platt - Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur
Professor of Law and Director, Center for Interdisciplinary Law and Policy Studies
The Ohio State University Moritz College of Law
Julie Shapiro  
Associate Professor of Law  
Seattle University School of Law

Andrew Siegel  
Assistant Professor  
University of South Carolina  
School of Law

Professor Marjorie A. Silver  
Touro Law Center

Professor Jana Singer  
University of Maryland  
School of Law

James H. Stark  
Professor of Law  
and Director of the Mediation Clinic  
University of Connecticut  
School of Law

Joan Steinman  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
Chicago-Kent College of Law

Robert Strassfeld  
Professor of Law  
Case Western Reserve  
University School of Law

Barbara Swartz  
Bruce K. Gould  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
Touro Law School

Dominick Vetri  
University of Oregon Law School

Rachel Vorspan  
Associate Professor  
Fordham University School of Law

Kathleen Wallman  
Visiting Research Professor  
Georgetown University  
Graduate School of Arts & Sciences  
Communication, Culture and Technology Program

Rhonda Wasserman  
Professor of Law  
University of Pittsburgh  
School of Law

Conrad Weiler, JD, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Department of Political Science  
Temple University

Deborah M. Weissman  
Professor of Law and Director of Clinical Programs  
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

William M. Wiecek  
Syracuse University College of Law

William J. Woodward, Jr.  
Professor of Law  
James Beasley School of Law  
Temple University

Richard Zitrin  
Adjunct Professor of Law, University of California at Hastings  
Adjunct Professor of Law, University of San Francisco